

## A. Introduction

1. **Title:** Real-time Reliability Monitoring and Analysis Capabilities
2. **Number:** TOP-010-1(i)
3. **Purpose:** Establish requirements for Real-time monitoring and analysis capabilities to support reliable System operations.
4. **Applicability:**
  - 4.1. **Functional Entities:**
    - 4.1.1. Transmission Operators
    - 4.1.2. Balancing Authorities
5. **Effective Date:** See Implementation Plan

## B. Requirements and Measures

- R1.** Each Transmission Operator shall implement an Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments. The Operating Process or Operating Procedure shall include: *[Violation Risk Factor: High] [Time Horizon: Real-time Operations]*
  - 1.1. Criteria for evaluating the quality of Real-time data;
  - 1.2. Provisions to indicate the quality of Real-time data to the System Operator; and
  - 1.3. Actions to address Real-time data quality issues with the entity(ies) responsible for providing the data when data quality affects Real-time Assessments.
- M1.** Each Transmission Operator shall have evidence that it implemented its Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments. This evidence could include, but is not limited to: 1) an Operating Process or Operating Procedure in electronic or hard copy format meeting all provisions of Requirement R1; and 2) evidence the Transmission Operator implemented the Operating Process or Operating Procedure as called for in the Operating Process or Operating Procedure, such as dated operator logs, dated checklists, voice recordings, voice transcripts, or other evidence.
- R2.** Each Balancing Authority shall implement an Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring. The Operating Process or Operating Procedure shall include: *[Violation Risk Factor: High] [Time Horizon: Real-time Operations]*
  - 2.1. Criteria for evaluating the quality of Real-time data;
  - 2.2. Provisions to indicate the quality of Real-time data to the System Operator; and

- 2.3.** Actions to address Real-time data quality issues with the entity(ies) responsible for providing the data when data quality affects its analysis functions.
- M2.** Each Balancing Authority shall have evidence that it implemented its Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring. This evidence could include, but is not limited to: 1) an Operating Process or Operating Procedure in electronic or hard copy format meeting all provisions of Requirement R2; and 2) evidence the Balancing Authority implemented the Operating Process or Operating Procedure as called for in the Operating Process or Operating Procedure, such as dated operator logs, dated checklists, voice recordings, voice transcripts, or other evidence.
- R3.** Each Transmission Operator shall implement an Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of analysis used in its Real-time Assessments. The Operating Process or Operating Procedure shall include: *[Violation Risk Factor: Medium] [Time Horizon: Real-time Operations]*
- 3.1.** Criteria for evaluating the quality of analysis used in its Real-time Assessments;
- 3.2.** Provisions to indicate the quality of analysis used in its Real-time Assessments; and
- 3.3.** Actions to address analysis quality issues affecting its Real-time Assessments.
- M3.** Each Transmission Operator shall have evidence it implemented its Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of analysis used in its Real-time Assessments as specified in Requirement R3. This evidence could include, but is not limited to: 1) an Operating Process or Operating Procedure in electronic or hard copy format meeting all provisions of Requirement R3; and 2) evidence the Transmission Operator implemented the Operating Process or Operating Procedure as called for in the Operating Process or Operating Procedure, such as dated operator logs, dated checklists, voice recordings, voice transcripts, or other evidence.
- R4.** Each Transmission Operator and Balancing Authority shall have an alarm process monitor that provides notification(s) to its System Operators when a failure of its Real-time monitoring alarm processor has occurred. *[Violation Risk Factor: Medium] [Time Horizon: Real-time Operations]*
- M4.** Each Transmission Operator and Balancing Authority shall have evidence of an alarm process monitor that provides notification(s) to its System Operators when a failure of its Real-time monitoring alarm processor has occurred. This evidence could include, but is not limited to, operator logs, computer printouts, system specifications, or other evidence.

## C. Compliance

- 1. Compliance Monitoring Process**
- 1.1. Compliance Enforcement Authority:**

“Compliance Enforcement Authority” means NERC or the Regional Entity, or any entity as otherwise designated by an Applicable Governmental Authority, in their respective roles of monitoring and/or enforcing compliance with mandatory and enforceable Reliability Standards in their respective jurisdictions.

**1.2. Evidence Retention:**

The following evidence retention period(s) identify the period of time an entity is required to retain specific evidence to demonstrate compliance. For instances where the evidence retention period specified below is shorter than the time since the last audit, the Compliance Enforcement Authority may ask an entity to provide other evidence to show it was compliant for the full-time period since the last audit.

The applicable entity shall keep data or evidence to show compliance as identified below unless directed by its Compliance Enforcement Authority to retain specific evidence for a longer period of time as part of an investigation.

The applicable entity shall retain evidence of compliance for Requirements R1, R2, and R4, and Measures M1, M2, and M4 for the current calendar year and one previous calendar year, with the exception of operator logs and voice recordings which shall be retained for a minimum of 90 calendar days, unless directed by its Compliance Enforcement Authority to retain specific evidence for a longer period of time as part of an investigation.

The Transmission Operator shall retain evidence of compliance for Requirement R3 and Measure M3 for a rolling 30-day period, unless directed by its Compliance Enforcement Authority to retain specific evidence for a longer period of time as part of an investigation.

If an applicable entity is found non-compliant it shall keep information related to the non-compliance until mitigation is complete and approved or for the time specified above, whichever is longer.

**1.3. Compliance Monitoring and Enforcement Program**

As defined in the NERC Rules of Procedure, “Compliance Monitoring and Enforcement Program” refers to the identification of the processes used to evaluate data or information for the purpose of assessing performance or outcomes with the associated Reliability Standard.

## Violation Severity Levels

R #	Violation Severity Levels			
	Lower VSL	Moderate VSL	High VSL	Severe VSL
<b>R1.</b>	N/A	The Transmission Operator's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments did not include one of the elements listed in Part 1.1 through Part 1.3.	The Transmission Operator's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments did not include two of the elements listed in Part 1.1 through Part 1.3.	The Transmission Operator's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments did not include any of the elements listed in Part 1.1 through Part 1.3;  OR  The Transmission Operator did not implement an Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments.
<b>R2.</b>	N/A	The Balancing Authority's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the	The Balancing Authority's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the	The Balancing Authority's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the

		Real-time data necessary to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring did not include one of the elements listed in Part 2.1 through Part 2.3.	Real-time data necessary to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring did not include two of the elements listed in Part 2.1 through Part 2.3.	Real-time data necessary to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring did not include any of the elements listed in Part 2.1 through Part 2.3; OR The Balancing Authority did not implement an Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of the Real-time data necessary to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring.
<b>R3.</b>	N/A	The Transmission Operator's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of analysis used in its Real-time Assessments did not include one of the elements listed in Part 3.1 through Part 3.3.	The Transmission Operator's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of analysis used in its Real-time Assessments did not include two of the elements listed in Part 3.1 through Part 3.3.	The Transmission Operator's Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of analysis used in its Real-time Assessments did not include any of the elements listed in Part 3.1 through Part 3.3; OR The Transmission Operator did not implement an Operating Process or Operating Procedure to address the quality of

				analysis used in its Real-time Assessments.
<b>R4.</b>	N/A	N/A	The responsible entity has an alarm process monitor but the alarm process monitor did not provide notification(s) to its System Operators when a failure of its Real-time monitoring alarm processor occurred.	The responsible entity does not have an alarm process monitor that provides notification(s) to its System Operators when a failure of its Real-time monitoring alarm processor has occurred.

#### D. Regional Variances

None.

#### E. Associated Documents

- [Implementation Plan](#)

#### Version History

Version	Date	Action	Change Tracking
1	October 30, 2015	New standard developed in Project 2009-02 to respond to recommendations in Real-time Best Practices Task Force Report and FERC directives.	N/A
1	May 5, 2016	Adopted by the Board of Trustees	New
1	September 22, 2016	FERC Order issued approving TOP-010-1. Docket No. RD16-6-000	

**TOP-010-1(i) – Real-time Reliability Monitoring and Analysis Capabilities**

---

1(i)	September 22, 2016	FERC directive to change Requirement 1 and Requirement 2 from 'medium' to 'high'. Docket No. RD16-6-000	Revised
1(i)	November 2, 2016	Adopted by the Board of Trustees	New
1(i)	December 14, 2016	FERC letter Order approving revisions to the VRF for R1 and R2 from 'medium' to 'high'. Docket No. RD16-6-001.	

### Guidelines and Technical Basis

*Real-time monitoring*, or *monitoring* the Bulk Electric System (BES) in Real-time, is a primary function of Reliability Coordinators (RCs), Transmission Operators (TOPs), and Balancing Authorities (BAs) as required by TOP and IRO Reliability Standards. As used in TOP and IRO Reliability Standards, monitoring involves observing operating status and operating values in Real-time for awareness of system conditions. Real-time monitoring may include the following activities performed in Real-time:

- Acquisition of operating data;
- Display of operating data as needed for visualization of system conditions;
- Audible or visual alerting when warranted by system conditions; and
- Audible or visual alerting when monitoring and analysis capabilities degrade or become unavailable.

#### **Requirement R1**

The TOP uses a set of Real-time data identified in TOP-003-3 Requirement R1 to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments. Functional requirements to perform monitoring and Real-time Assessments appear in other Reliability Standards.

The TOP's Operating Process or Operating Procedure must contain criteria for evaluating the quality of Real-time data as specified in proposed TOP-010-1 Requirement R1 Part 1.1. The criteria support identification of applicable data quality issues, which may include:

- Data outside of a prescribed data range;
- Analog data not updated within a predetermined time period;
- Data entered manually to override telemetered information; or
- Data otherwise identified as invalid or suspect.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must include provisions for indicating the quality of Real-time data to operating personnel. Descriptions of quality indicators such as display color codes, data quality flags, or other such indicators as found in Real-time monitoring specifications could be used.

Requirement R1 Part 1.3 specifies the TOP shall include actions to address Real-time data quality issues with the entity(ies) responsible for providing the data when data quality affects Real-time Assessments. Requirement R1 Part 1.3 is focused on addressing data point quality issues affecting Real-time Assessments. Other data quality issues of a lower priority are addressed according to an entity's operating practices and are not covered under Requirement R1 Part 1.3.

The TOP's actions to address data quality issues are steps within existing authorities and capabilities that provide awareness and enable the TOP to meet its obligations for performing the Real-time Assessment. Examples of actions to address data quality issues include, but are not limited to, the following:



- Notifying entities that provide Real-time data to the TOP;
- Following processes established for resolving data conflicts as specified in TOP-003-3, or other applicable Reliability Standards;
- Taking corrective actions on the TOP's own data;
- Changing data sources or other inputs so that the data quality issue no longer affects the TOP's Real-time Assessment; and
- Inputting data manually and updating as necessary.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must clearly identify to operating personnel how to determine the data that affects the quality of the Real-time Assessment so that effective actions can be taken to address data quality issues in an appropriate timeframe.

### **Requirement R2**

The BA uses a set of Real-time data identified in TOP-003-3 Requirement R2 to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring. Requirements to perform monitoring appear in other Reliability Standards.

The BA's Operating Process or Operating Procedure must contain criteria for evaluating the quality of Real-time data as specified in proposed TOP-010-1 Requirement R2 Part 2.1. The criteria supports identification of applicable data quality issues, which may include:

- Data outside of a prescribed data range;
- Analog data not updated within a predetermined time period;
- Data entered manually to override telemetered information; or
- Data otherwise identified as invalid or suspect.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must include provisions for indicating the quality of Real-time data to operating personnel. Descriptions of quality indicators such as display color codes, data quality flags, or other such indicators as found in Real-time monitoring specifications could be used.

Requirement R2 Part 2.3 specifies the BA shall include in its Operating Process or Operating Procedure actions to address Real-time data quality issues when data quality affects its analysis functions. Requirement R2 Part 2.3 is focused on addressing data point quality issues affecting analysis functions. Other data quality issues of a lower priority are addressed according to an entity's operating practices and are not covered under Requirement R2 Part 2.3.

The BA's actions to address data quality issues are steps within existing authorities and capabilities that provide awareness and enable the BA to meet its obligations for performing its analysis functions. Examples of actions to address data quality issues include, but are not limited to, the following:

- Notifying entities that provide Real-time data to the BA;

- Following processes established for resolving data conflicts as specified in TOP-003-3 or other applicable Reliability Standards;
- Taking corrective actions on the BA's own data;
- Changing data sources or other inputs so that the data quality issue no longer affects the BA's analysis functions; and
- Inputting data manually and updating as necessary.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must clearly identify to operating personnel how to determine the data that affects the analysis quality so that effective actions can be taken to address data quality issues in an appropriate timeframe.

### **Requirement R3**

Requirement R3 ensures TOPs have procedures to address issues related to the quality of the analysis results used for Real-time Assessments. Requirements to perform Real-time Assessments appear in other Reliability Standards. Examples of the types of analysis used in Real-time Assessments may include, as applicable, state estimation, Real-time Contingency analysis, Stability analysis or other studies used for Real-time Assessments.

Examples of the types of criteria used to evaluate the quality of analysis used in Real-time Assessments may include solution tolerances, mismatches with Real-time data, convergences, etc.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must describe how the quality of analysis results used in Real-time Assessment will be shown to operating personnel.

### **Requirement R4**

Requirement R4 addresses recommendation S7 of the Real-time Best Practices Task Force report concerning operator awareness of alarm availability.

An alarm process monitor could be an application within a Real-time monitoring system or it could be a separate system. 'Heartbeat' or 'watchdog' monitors are examples of an alarm process monitor. An alarm process monitor should be designed and implemented such that a stall of the Real-time monitoring alarm processor does not cause a failure of the alarm process monitor.

### Rationale

**Rationale for Requirement R1:** The Transmission Operator (TOP) uses a set of Real-time data identified in TOP-003-3 Requirement R1 to perform its Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments. Functional requirements to perform Real-time monitoring and Real-time Assessments appear in other Reliability Standards.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must include provisions for indicating the quality of Real-time data to operating personnel. Descriptions of quality indicators such as display color codes, data quality flags, or other such indicators as found in Real-time monitoring specifications could be used.

Requirement R1 Part 1.3 of this standard specifies the TOP shall include actions to address Real-time data quality issues affecting its Real-time Assessments in its Operating Process or Operating Procedure. Examples of actions to address Real-time data quality issues are provided in the Guidelines and Technical Basis section. These actions could be the same as the process used to resolve data conflicts required by TOP-003-3 Requirement R5 Part 5.2, provided that this process addresses Real-time data quality issues.

The revision in Part 1.3 to address Real-time data quality issues *when data quality affects Real-time Assessments* clarifies the scope of data points that must be covered by the Operating Process or Operating Procedure.

**Rationale for Requirement R2:** The Balancing Authority (BA) uses a set of Real-time data identified in TOP-003-3 Requirement R2 to perform its analysis functions and Real-time monitoring. Requirements to perform monitoring appear in other Reliability Standards.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must include provisions for indicating the quality of Real-time data to operating personnel. Descriptions of quality indicators such as display color codes, data quality flags, or other such indicators as found in Real-time monitoring specifications could be used.

Requirement R2 Part 2.3 of this standard specifies the BA shall include actions to address Real-time data quality issues affecting its analysis functions in its Operating Process or Operating Procedure. Examples of actions to address Real-time data quality issues are provided in the Guidelines and Technical Basis section. These actions could be the same as the process to resolve data conflicts required by TOP-003-3 Requirement R5 Part 5.2 provided that this process addresses Real-time data quality issues.

The revision in Part 2.3 to address Real-time data quality issues *when data quality affects its analysis functions* clarifies the scope of data points that must be covered by the Operating Process or Operating Procedure.

**Rationale for Requirement R3:** Requirement R3 ensures TOPs have procedures to address issues related to the quality of the analysis results used for Real-time Assessments. Requirements to perform Real-time Assessments appear in other Reliability Standards. Examples of the types of analysis used in Real-time Assessments include, as applicable, state

estimation, Real-time Contingency analysis, Stability analysis or other studies used for Real-time Assessments.

The Operating Process or Operating Procedure must include provisions for how the quality of analysis results used in Real-time Assessment will be shown to operating personnel. Operating personnel includes System Operators and staff responsible for supporting Real-time operations.

**Rationale for Requirement R4:** The requirement addresses recommendation S7 of the Real-time Best Practices Task Force report concerning operator awareness of alarm availability.

The requirement in Draft Two of the proposed standard has been revised for clarity by removing the term *independent*. The alarm process monitor must be able to provide notification of failure of the Real-time monitoring alarm processor. This capability could be provided by an application within a Real-time monitoring system or by a separate component used by the System Operator. The alarm process monitor must not fail with a simultaneous failure of the Real-time monitoring alarm processor.

## Appendix TOP-010-1(i)-QC-1

### Specific provisions applicable in Québec for standard TOP-010-1(i) – Real-time Reliability Monitoring and Analysis Capabilities

---

This appendix establishes specific provisions for the application of the standard in Québec. Provisions of the standard and of this appendix must be read jointly for comprehension and interpretation purposes. Where the standard and appendix differ, the appendix shall prevail.

#### A. Introduction

1. **Title:** No specific provisions.
2. **Number:** No specific provisions.
3. **Purpose:** No specific provisions.
4. **Applicability:**
  - 4.1. **Functional Entities**  
No specific provisions.
5. **Effective date:**
  - 5.1. Adoption of the standard by the Régie de l'énergie: Month xx, 201x
  - 5.2. Adoption of this appendix by the Régie de l'énergie: Month xx, 201x
  - 5.3. Effective date of the standard and of this appendix in Québec: Month xx, 201x

#### B. Requirements and Measures

No specific provisions.

#### C. Compliance

1. **Compliance Monitoring Process**
  - 1.1. **Compliance Enforcement Authority**  
In Québec, "Compliance Enforcement Authority" means the Régie de l'énergie in its roles of monitoring and enforcing compliance with respect to the Reliability Standard and to this appendix.
  - 1.2. **Evidence Retention**  
No specific provisions.
  - 1.3. **Compliance Monitoring and Enforcement Program**  
The Régie de l'énergie establishes the monitoring processes used to evaluate data or information for the purpose of determining compliance or non-compliance with the Reliability Standard and with this appendix.

#### Violation Severity Levels

No specific provisions.

#### D. Regional Variances

No specific provisions.

#### E. Associated Documents

No specific provisions.

## Appendix TOP-010-1(i)-QC-1

### Specific provisions applicable in Québec for standard TOP-010-1(i) – Real-time Reliability Monitoring and Analysis Capabilities

---

#### Guidelines and Technical Basis

No specific provisions.

#### Rationale

No specific provisions.

#### Version history

Version	Date	Action	Change tracking
1	Month xx, 201x	New appendix	New